ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
December 4th, 2019 – 3:00 P.M.
Multi-Purpose Room, Mobile Government Plaza, 205 Government Street

A. CALL TO ORDER

1. The Chair, Steve Stone, called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m. Christine Dawson, Historic Development Staff, called the roll as follows.

   **Members Present:** Abby Davis, Andre Rathle, Joseph Rodrigues, Steve Stone, Gypsie Van Antwerp and Jim Wagoner.
   **Members Absent:** Robert Brown, Catarina Echols, Kim Harden, Nick Holmes, and Craig Roberts.
   **Staff Members Present:** Christine Dawson, John Sledge, Bridget Daniel, and Marion McElroy.

2. Mr. Rodrigues moved to approve the minutes from November 20th meeting. The motion was seconded by Ms. Davis and approved unanimously.

3. Mr. Wagoner moved to approve the Mid-Months as written. The motion was seconded by Mr. Rodrigues and the Mid-Months were approved unanimously.

B. MID-MONTH APPROvals: APPROVED.

1. **Applicant:** James L. Johnson
   a. **Property Address:** 308 Breamwood Avenue
   b. **Date of Approval:** 10/21/2019
   c. **Project:** Construct either 3’ wooden fence or 4’ metal fence in front of house along the side perimeter of the lot. Install security door on the front and back door of the house that minimally impact the historic character. If necessary, paint security door to blend in with front and back doors by using the same color of paint.

2. **Applicant:** Liberty Roofing Company Inc.
   a. **Property Address:** 203 George Street
   b. **Date of Approval:** 10/22/2019
   c. **Project:** Reroof with architectural shingles in slate.

3. **Applicant:** Malaga Properties Inc.
   a. **Property Address:** 359 Church Street
   b. **Date of Approval:** 10/25/2019
   c. **Project:** Construct dumpster pad at existing dumpster site located towards the rear of the lot. Enclose with 6’ (or to match dumpster height) wooden privacy fence on three sides.

4. **Applicant:** John E. Williams
   a. **Property Address:** 10 S Lafayette Street
   b. **Date of Approval:** 10/29/2019
   c. **Project:** Repair water-damaged areas and replace deteriorated wood to match in dimension, profile and material. Repair roof to match.

5. **Applicant:** PCI Support Services
   a. **Property Address:** 65 Government Street
   b. **Date of Approval:** 10/29/2019
   c. **Project:** Install metal “Exploreum” sign on Government Street with directed or backlit lighting. Sign will meet the size of the previous sign by the BZA.

6. **Applicant:** Francis Holdings, LLC
   a. **Property Address:** 202 S Georgia Avenue
   b. **Date of Approval:** 10/30/2019
   c. **Project:** Reroof with architectural shingles in charcoal/ gray. Repair deteriorated siding and wood to match existing in dimension, profile, and material. Repaint to match.
7. **Applicant:** Legacy Roof Contractors LLC  
   a. Property Address: 253 Michigan Avenue  
   b. Date of Approval: 10/31/2019  
   c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles, pewter color.

8. **Applicant:** Liberty Roofing Company Inc.  
   a. Property Address: 1414 Old Shell Road  
   b. Date of Approval: 10/31/2019  
   c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingles, charcoal color to match in dimension, profile and material.

9. **Applicant:** J. M. Abernathy  
   a. Property Address: 363 McDonald Avenue  
   b. Date of Approval: 11/04/2019  
   c. Project: Construct six-foot privacy fence across rear property line.

10. **Applicant:** Warren Herlong  
    a. Property Address: 7 Common Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/05/2019  
    c. Project: Reroof, charcoal gray, and repair any rotten wood as necessary.

11. **Applicant:** MZA LLC  
    a. Property Address: 121 Dauphin Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/07/2019  
    c. Project: Chalkboard menu sidewalk sign.

12. **Applicant:** Ben Sumrall, Jr.  
    a. Property Address: 1166 New St Francis Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/07/2019  
    c. Project: Repair deteriorated wood, windows, and doors to match in dimension, profile and material. Replace any deteriorated wood components to match in dimension, profile and material.

13. **Applicant:** Friendship House Corporation  
    a. Property Address: 57 N Broad Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/08/2019  
    c. Project: Shore up front porch, replace first story front columns to match original round ones in profile and dimension; repair/replace rotten siding, balusters to match original in material, profile, and dimension. Repaint to match.

14. **Applicant:** David Naman  
    a. Property Address: 270 Dauphin Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/07/2019  
    c. Project: Place letters in existing aluminum cabinet.

15. **Applicant:** Andrew Associates  
    a. Property Address: 1971 Government Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/12/2019  
    c. Project: Install illuminated letters on signfront.

16. **Applicant:** Howard Jackson  
    a. Property Address: 1000 Selma Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/13/2019  
    c. Project: Install concrete driveway, ten feet wide by twenty-five feet long at rear of house.

17. **Applicant:** BJE Properties  
    a. Property Address: 508-518 Dauphin Street  
    b. Date of Approval: 11/13/2019  
    c. Project: Repair or replace windows to match. (Storefront will be replaced with storefront if necessary.) Open up transoms on central building. Install canopies and awnings.
18. Applicant: Apex Roofing and Restoration LLC
   a. Property Address: 20 Semmes Avenue
   b. Date of Approval: 11/14/2019
   c. Project: Reroof with CertainTeed Landmark architectural shingles, noire black color, to match in dimension, profile and material.

19. Applicant: ERC Roofing & Construction / The Damage Experts LLC
   a. Property Address: 1051 Government Street
   b. Date of Approval: 11/14/2019
   c. Project: Reroof with architectural shingle to match. Repair or replace fascia and other deteriorated wood to match in dimension, profile, and material. Repaint to match. Replace plywood currently located in dormer/eyebrow area and replace with 4" or less hardieplank siding.

20. Applicant: Donna Flowers
   a. Property Address: 308 Michigan Avenue
   b. Date of Approval: 11/15/2019
   c. Project: Repaint eaves. Repair deteriorated wood around front door and back to match. Repaint doors "Toile Red" by Sherwin Williams. Remove remaining storm windows. Repair existing windows. Repair and repaint front entrance handrail. Install vent from kitchen to exterior on rear elevation. Vent will be minimal in size and painted to match scheme. Remove panel of privacy fence to allow for vehicular access.

21. Applicant: Mikal Raheem
   a. Property Address: 1158 Texas Street
   b. Date of Approval: 11/18/2019
   c. Project: Patch metal roof, replace rotten siding to match material, dimension and profile, repaint, and repair sills.

22. Applicant: Richard Gibson
   a. Property Address: 206 S Dearborn Street
   b. Date of Approval: 11/18/2019
   c. Project: Reroof weatherwood.

23. Applicant: Rebecca Shaw
   a. Property Address: 254 S Ann Street
   b. Date of Approval: 11/18/2019
   c. Project: Patch broken concrete at driveway and sidewalk.

24. Applicant: Samuel Perloff
   a. Property Address: 1120 Dauphin St
   b. Date of Approval: 11/18/2019
   c. Project: Repaint exterior of house white with green trim to match existing in dimension, profile and material.

C. APPLICATIONS

   a. Applicant: Jessica Edwards, Garner Dental Group
   b. Project: Paint brick veneer exterior; repaint trim work and exterior doors
   APPROVED. CERTIFIED RECORD ATTACHED.

D. OTHER BUSINESS

The next meeting of the ARB will be on December 18, 2019.
APPLICATION FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
CERTIFIED RECORD

Applicant: Jessica Edwards, Garner Dental Group
Received: 11/18/2019
Meeting: 12/4/2019

INTRODUCTION TO THE APPLICATION

Historic District: Old Dauphin Way
Classification: Non-contributing
Zoning: B-1
Project: Paint brick veneer exterior; repaint trim work and exterior doors

BUILDING HISTORY

According to the Mobile County tax assessor’s record, the building was constructed in 1965. The structure appears on the 1967 aerial photo of the area, supporting the tax assessor’s date. The one-story, brick veneered commercial building rests on a slightly raised foundation and is covered with a hipped roof. The property appears to retain its original steel windows on the north and south elevations. The windows on the east and west elevations were replaced circa 1990, and a handicapped accessibility ramp was added to the east elevation at approximately the same time.

STANDARD OF REVIEW

Section 9 of the Preservation Ordinance states “the Board shall not approve any application proposing a Material Change in Appearance unless it finds the change…will not materially impair the architectural or historic value of the building, the buildings on adjacent sites or in the immediate vicinity, or the general visual character of the district…”

STAFF REPORT

A. According to the MHDC vertical files, this property has not appeared before the Board.
B. The Design Review Guidelines for Mobile’s Historic Districts state, in pertinent part:
   1. “Distinctive stylistic features and other examples of skilled craftsmanship should be preserved.”
   2. “Pay special attention to maintaining the historic appearance of building walls of corner buildings.”
   3. “Do not cover or obscure original building materials.”
   4. “Use of color and color schemes that reflect a building’s predominant historic period are encouraged. A painting project should reflect the historic character of the property and of the district.”
   5. “Do not paint over exposed brick.”

C. Scope of Work:
   1. Paint the brick veneer. The proposed color is Sherwin Williams Alabaster.
   2. Paint the trim work and windows. The proposed color is Sherwin Williams Iron Ore.
STAFF ANALYSIS

The subject property, 1754 Government Street, is located within the Old Dauphin Way Historic District. The application under review involves painting the brick veneer exterior and repainting the trim work and windows.

The brick veneer exterior is composed of soft bricks in varying shades of brown and black. The pointing is in a V-joint style (see B.1). The bricks have never been painted. Although the structure is non-contributing to the historic district, its location on a prominent corner in the district makes it very visible (see B.2), and painting the brick exterior would obscure the brick pointing (see B.3). The Design Review Guidelines do not permit painting unpainted brick (see B.5).

With regard to repainting the trim work and windows, the proposed color is compatible with the period of the building and, therefore, permissible by the Design Review Guidelines (see B.4).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Based on B (1-5), Staff believes portion of the application requesting the painting of the brick exterior would impair the architectural or the historical character of the surrounding district. Staff recommends the Board approve the painting of the trim work and windows in the requested color.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Ms. Edwards, the owner’s representative, was present to discuss the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board discussion took place concurrently with the public testimony.

Mr. Stone verified that the applicant was not seeking to replace the windows and doors at this time. Ms. Edwards confirmed that those issues were still under consideration by the owner.

Ms. Edwards stated that Dr. Garner, the owner of the property, owned twelve dental clinics in Mississippi, and this would be his first in Mobile. This was the first occasion that Garner Dental Group had worked in a historic district, and it was their intention to do everything by the rules. Because they are new to Mobile, they wished to brighten up the appearance of the existing building to both attract attention to the clinic and make it an appealing place to visit.

Mr. Stone noted that the ARB had on three previous occasions approved the painting of bricks on corner buildings, and the precedent was set.

Mr. Rodrigues inquired whether the downspouts, railings, and planter boxes (on the Government Street and Houston street elevations) would be painted. Ms. Edwards stated that they would all be painted.

Ms. Van Antwerp inquired about the sign in front of the building. Ms. Edwards stated that the sign would be replaced, but that project had not been put in motion as it depended on the color scheme of the building. It was noted that a new sign would also require ARB review.

There was no further Board discussion at that time.

No members of the public were present to speak for or against the application. Mr. Stone closed the period of public comment.
FINDING OF FACT

Mr. Rodrigues moved that, based on the evidence presented in the amended application and during public testimony, the Board finds the facts in the Staff Report as written.

The motion was seconded by Mr. Wagoner and was approved unanimously.

DECISION ON THE APPLICATION

Mr. Rodrigues moved that, with the application amended to show painting of the brick veneer exterior and repainting of the trim and doors, and based on the facts approved by the Board, the changes proposed by the applicant do not impair the integrity of the property or neighborhood and a Certificate of Appropriateness be granted.

The motion was seconded by Ms. Davis and was unanimously approved.